

LAND NORTH WEST OF 1 TO 12 TWELVE HOUSES, Sowbrook Lane, Stanton By Dale, Derbyshire

Summary Appeal Statement

July 2023

Final v0.1

Document No: TJC2023.97a

Appeal Ref: APPN1025W233319160



Contact Details

Cedar House
38 Trap Lane
Sheffield
South Yorkshire
S11 7RD

Tel: 0114 287 0323

Disclaimer

This document has been prepared with the best data made available at the time of survey and research. It is, therefore, not possible to guarantee the accuracy of secondary data provided by another party, or source. The report has been prepared in good faith and in accordance with accepted guidance issued by the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists. Digital versions of this document may contain images that have been down-sampled and are reduced in quality.

Copyright

The copyright of this document is assigned to the Client, however the JESSOP Consultancy must be acknowledged as the author of the document.

The JESSOP Consultancy (TJC Heritage Limited)

The JESSOP Consultancy is the trading name of TJC Heritage Limited, a United Kingdom Registered Company - No.9505554.

The JESSOP Consultancy is a Registered Organisation of the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists and all work is undertaken in accordance with their Code of Conduct (CIfA 2022).

SUMMARY OF PROJECT DETAILS

TJC Project Code:	E69
Project Type(s):	Summary Appeal Statement
National Grid Reference:	SK 4636 3935 (centred)
Postcode:	LE14 3RA (nearest)
County:	Derbyshire
District/Unitary Authority:	Erewash
Parish:	Stanton-by-Dale
Elevation:	c. 50m above Ordnance Datum
Planning Reference(s):	Outline Planning Application for up to 196 dwellings with all matters reserved other than the means of access at Land North West Of 1 To 12 Twelve Houses, Sowbrook Lane, Stanton By Dale, Derbyshire (ERE/0722/0038)
Designation Status(s):	No designated heritage assets within the site.
Fieldwork/site survey by:	Dan Slatcher MCIfA
Prepared by:	Dan Slatcher MCIfA
Reviewed by	Oliver Jessop MCIfA
Date:	11.07.2023
Version:	Final v0.4

INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND

I.1.1. My name is Dan Slatcher, and I am a Heritage Consultant with The JESSOP Consultancy (TJC Heritage Ltd), an independent heritage consultancy based in Sheffield. I hold a BA (Hons) in Archaeology and History (University of York) and an MA in Historical Archaeology (University of Sheffield). I am a Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries (FSA) and a Member of the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (MCI(A)), where I am also a member of the Board of Directors. I have some 30 years post qualification experience.

I.1.2. TJC Heritage produced a Heritage Statement dated October 2022 (see **Appendix I**) of the main appeal statement to inform the planning application. I was the author of this report.

I.1.3. I confirm that the opinions expressed within this appeal statement are my true and professional opinions.

SCOPE OF STATEMENT

I.1.4. This statement focuses upon the following designated heritage asset referred to in the Reasons for Refusal Number 7:

- New Stanton Cottages (Grade II Listed Building, NHLE: 1329236)

I.1.5. The consideration of the planning balance of the proposed development will be dealt with by Mr Hawley.

I.1.6. The evidence prepared and provided within this appeal statement has been prepared with the guidance of Chartered Institute for Archaeologists and their Code of Conduct (CI(A), 2022).

REASON FOR REFUSAL

I.1.7. This appeal statement relates to the Refusal of Planning Permission, regarding application ERE/0722/0038 dated 13th October 2022. Specifically, this statement relates to Reason 7 for refusal, which states the following:

“The proposal would result in adverse changes to the setting of the Grade II listed building at New Stanton Cottages which would detract from the manner in which it is experienced, appreciated and

understood. This meets the threshold of "less than substantial harm" to the designated heritage asset and as no public benefits exist which are sufficient to overcome that harm, the proposal is contrary to the requirements of the NPPF."

ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY

I.1.8. The approach to assessing the effect on the settings of heritage assets adopted in this proof of evidence follows the approach set out in the Heritage Statement (submitted as part of the outline application).

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE AND CONTRIBUTION OF SETTING

INTRODUCTION

I.1.9. Erewash Borough Council's reason for refusal outlines that they consider that a single designated heritage asset is affected by the proposed development sufficient to refuse the proposal. This is New Stanton Cottages (Grade II Listed Building, NHLE: 1329236)

NEW STANTON COTTAGES

I.1.10. New Stanton Cottages (Grade II Listed Building, NHLE: 1329236) is situated immediately south of the site on the south side of Sowbrook Lane. The listed building is located immediately north of a large industrial site, and to the north is the site, sloping gently down to the Nutbrook Canal.

I.1.11. The current setting of New Stanton Cottages is formed by its topographic location and position in the surrounding semi-rural landscape. The setting of the listed buildings is formed by the Stanton Precast Works and other industrial premises to the south, to the northeast by the cleared site of the Stanton Ironworks, and to the north by Sowbrook Lane and the site. Only fragments of the local landscape surrounding the designated asset are legible in terms of previous land use. More distantly, the southern elements of the settlement at Ilkeston, in particular Kirk Hallam and Little Hallam, have extended towards the site.

I.1.12. The changes in the landscape of the locality have altered the setting of the listed building from its mid-19th century and later state. The relationship between New Stanton Cottages and the Stanton Ironworks has been compromised by the demolition and site clearance at the latter. Overall, the contribution of setting to the significance of the listed building is **limited** and its sensitivity to further change in its setting is low.

I.1.13. Where visible, the site does not lie in a key view. As discussed above, the setting of New Stanton Cottages is already impacted and eroded by development in the area. Development within the site will alter this view and result in the reduction of visible agricultural land. Despite this, as the planning application is currently in outline form, it is considered that there is the opportunity to mitigate this impact through scale, massing and design of development and by appropriate screening through tree and hedgerow planting and thickening.

CONCLUSION

I.1.14. Relevant information from the planning application, including the Decision Notice, the Officers Reports, Consultation advice, and the Heritage Statement has been reviewed.

I.1.15. In addition, consideration has been given to the advice on levels of harm to heritage assets given in Planning Practice Guidance on the Historic Environment at paragraph: 018 Reference ID: 18a-018-20190723 Revision date: 23 07 2019.

I.1.16. The conclusions of the Heritage Statement with respect to New Stanton Cottages note that the proposed development would have no impacts on the fabric of any designated assets, either listed buildings or conservation areas.

I.1.17. In regard to New Stanton Cottages (Grade II listed building) the harm would be less than substantial in nature and towards the lower end of this scale.

I.1.18. This review has confirmed that the conclusions of the Heritage Statement are correct. This means in effect that the overall impact of the proposed development on designated heritage assets is considered to be less than substantial harm and would be at the lower end of that scale. On this basis the public benefits of the scheme should be weighed against that harm, as indicated in paragraph 202 of NPPF.

